



WYOMING LEGISLATIVE SERVICE OFFICE

Memorandum

DATE December 8, 2017

TO Members, Management Council

FROM Matt Obrecht, Director
Jamie Schaub, Information Technology Manager
Anthony Sara, Legislative Support Manager

SUBJECT Potential Live Streaming & Recording of Interim Committee Meetings

At its last meeting, the Select Committee on Legislative Facilities, Technology and Process (Select Committee) passed a motion recommending Management Council implement on a trial basis for the 2018 interim one or more of the below options for live streaming and recording of interim committee meetings. The purpose of a trial period would be to test the feasibility of the options used and to identify any potential issues or unexpected consequences with live streaming or recording of interim committee meetings. The following lists four options and their associated needs and cost for implementation. Note, the first three options require a fast and reliable internet connection. Past interim committee meetings have been held at facilities with slow or faulty internet connections, as well as at facilities that do not have internet or that have refused committee access to the internet for security reasons. Implementation of any of these options will require a change in policy and culture when determining where to hold interim committee meetings.

Option 1 – Wyoming PBS—Wyoming PBS staff would be responsible for the recording and broadcasting of interim committee meetings likely using two camera angles. This option has already been used this interim by Wyoming PBS to stream and record the June 12 Joint Revenue and School Recalibration meeting and the October 12 and 13 School Recalibration meeting. With its current limited staff, Wyoming PBS expects it could only live stream 10 committee meetings per interim. The Legislature would be responsible for the travel and per diem costs for two PBS staff to attend those meetings. At the request of the Select Committee, Wyoming PBS provided an estimate on the cost for live streaming and archiving 32 interim committee meetings, which Wyoming PBS expects would require 2 new FTEs (Appendix B).

Approximate Setup Cost: \$0 **Approximate Annual Cost:** \$9,000 based on 10 meetings
\$120,461.10 based on 32 meetings

Option 2 – Wyoming Enterprise Technology Services – Simultaneously record and broadcast the meeting using Google Hangouts OnAir or YouTube Live. LSO staff would be responsible for the operation of a laptop to run the software and a video camera. The laptop would either attach to an existing sound system if available in the meeting room or portable microphones the Legislature would own. This

option has minimal setup costs, which includes a one-time purchase of the necessary equipment. The Google Hangouts OnAir and YouTube Live software applications are free. However, additional LSO staff may be required at the meetings to run the video cameras and provide IT support.

Approximate Setup Cost: \$3,000 **Approximate Annual Cost:** Additional FTEs

Option 3 – Web Video integrated with Wyoming Legislative Management System - Simultaneously record and broadcast the meeting using a packaged system that is integrated into a legislative management system. The laptop would either attach to an existing sound system if available in the meeting room or portable microphones the Legislature would own. This option would require LSO staff to index the video file during the meeting, so it would be searchable and bookmarked. Option Three would likely be the most expensive option since it would require an annual subscription for use of the legislative management system and possibly additional LSO staff to attend meetings and index the video file. It is also the only option of the four that would allow agendas, bills and other documents to be indexed and associated with the live and archived audio.

Approximate Setup Cost: \$8,000 **Approximate Annual Cost:** \$10,000 & Additional FTEs

Option 4 – Provide Audio Recording Only Following Each Interim Committee Meeting –

Option Four would not provide livestreaming during the meeting, but instead a recording would be made available in the form of an MP3 file on the Legislature’s Website, following the meeting. The file would be posted after the LSO staff member returned from the meeting. No internet connection or setup of livestreaming equipment would be required, since the file wouldn’t be uploaded until the staffer returns to Cheyenne. This option would require the passage of 2017-HB 276, which would no longer require staff to listen to each audio file to ensure confidential conversations were not picked up by the recorder prior to being made public.

Approximate Setup Cost: \$0* **Approximate Annual Cost:** \$0

*Although the Legislature owns recording equipment that could be used for this purpose, the quality of the recording may be poor for listening, depending on the venue. Often, the recorders do not pick up the committee’s discussion in its entirety because of poor sound quality in the room or when members of the committee forget to use their microphone. The Legislature may want to explore purchasing better recording equipment if Option Four is implemented.

Appendix A is a table listing the pros and cons of each option. Please let us know if you have any questions.

Appendix A

| | Pros | Cons |
|---|---|--|
| Wyoming PBS | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HD TV production quality • On-site technical support • No operation required by legislative staff | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • With current Wyoming PBS staff, limited number of meetings per year • Reimburse PBS staff travel/per diem • Site specific performance based on internet connectivity • No indexing available • No integration with bills, documents, members, etc. |
| Wyoming Enterprise Technology Services | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Low setup costs • ETS technicians around the State to provide technical support if needed • User friendly software | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Setup, monitoring, management and maintenance by legislative staff • Additional LSO FTEs may be required • Site specific performance based on internet connectivity • No indexing • No integration with bills, documents, members, etc. |
| Web Video integrated with Wyoming LMS | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Specialize in legislative streaming • Integration with meeting management • Indexing with agenda items, bills, documents, members, etc. • Live video with agenda • Custom content | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Setup, monitoring, management and maintenance by legislative staff • Additional LSO FTEs may be required • Site specific performance based on internet connectivity • Need staff to index during meeting • Likely highest cost – custom work, monthly/annual fee |
| Audio Recordings | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No internet connection required • Low cost • Less setup and management for staff • Staff no longer required to listen to recordings • Available for all interim committee meetings, including Select Committees & Task Forces | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No video available • Would not be available until after the meeting • No indexing available • No integration with bills, documents, members, etc. • Current recordings do not always provide high-quality recording |



Estimate for Live Streaming and Archiving of Wyoming Legislative Standing Committee Meetings

Assumptions:

- 1) 32 meetings between April and mid-December.
- 2) One meeting at a time to be streamed and archived.
- 3) 2 new WyomingPBS staff positions will be required at $\frac{3}{4}$ FTE each; a producer to oversee the production and a director/videographer to assist in the production.
- 4) Estimated expenses reflect out of pocket costs based on required travel.
- 5) No overhead or "profit" is included in the estimate.
- 6) WyomingPBS will provide live streams on both YouTube and Facebook and will archive all videos at no charge.
- 7) Video and audio quality will meet or exceed the quality previously streamed hearings.
- 8) Production of other WyomingPBS programs will not be impacted.

Staff Positions:

| | |
|--|-------------|
| Producer - $\frac{3}{4}$ FTE including benefits | |
| Total Compensation | \$47,437.71 |
| Director/Videographer - $\frac{3}{4}$ FTE including benefits | |
| Total Compensation | \$43,983.39 |

Expenses:

| | |
|---|---------------------|
| Mileage 500 miles @ \$0.535/mile | \$267.50 |
| Meals for 2 crew for 3 days @ \$46 (average state per diem) | \$276.00 |
| Lodging for 2 crew @ state rate of \$91/night | <u>\$364.00</u> |
| Sub-Total Expenses/meeting | \$907.50 |
| Total Expenses for 32 meetings | <u>\$29,040.00</u> |
| | \$120,461.10 |

Technical requirements:

- Broadband access of with internet speeds of 5 to 10mb/s
- Facility provides adequate amount of table microphones for every 2 committee members
- Facility provides adequate amount of table microphones for every 2 individuals giving testimony
- Audio program out with 1/8 inch or 1/4 inch output
- Sufficient space for 2 cameras/tripods

Kyle Nicholoff
 Production Services Manager
 WyomingPBS
kyle@cw.edu
 307-855-2368